

REPORT

of

THE NEW BRUNSWICK ROYAL COMMISSION

on

FINANCE AND MUNICIPAL  
TAXATION

“What counts is to make up our minds to see things in the perspective of building the future, not of preserving the past.”

Jean Monnet, Architect of  
the European Common Market.

Fredericton, N. B.

November, 1963

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Letter of transmittal

The terms of reference:

a) Fiscal Inquiries Act

b) Order in Council 62-185 of March 8, 1962

Foreword by Mr. Edward G. Byrne, Q.C.,  
Chairman

Table of Contents

INTRODUCTION: A note on the Commission's  
procedure and the structure  
of the report

## PART I: SUMMARY OF FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

CHAPTER ONE: Summary of findings and  
recommendations 2

- I. Nature of the task
- II. The Package Deal
- III. Outline of the remainder of the chapter
- IV. Municipal taxation-the over-all burden
- V. The weight of tax in the various municipalities
- VI. The distribution of taxes within municipalities
- VII. Inequities arising from the law
- VIII. The tax agreements between municipalities and industry
- IX. Provincial revenues
- X. Municipal debt
- XI. Municipal autonomy
- XII. Consolidation of municipal services
- XIII. Amalgamations and annexations
- XIV. The division of functions between the provincial government and the municipalities
- XV. Public education
- XVI. Social welfare
- XVII. Hospitals and public health
- \*\*XVIII. The administration of justice
- XIX. Civil defence
- xx. Why so many administrative commissions?
- XXI. The new municipal structure
- XXII. The new "villages"
- XXIII. Local service districts
- XXIV. Collection of the real property taxes
- xxv. The Municipal Affairs Commission
- XXVI. The special position of Oromocto
- XXVII. The statutory foundation for responsible municipal government
- XXVIII. Future responsibility for existing debt

- XXIX. The equalizing unconditional grants  
xxx. Impact upon provincial revenues
- XXXI. Inadequacy of present federal-provincial fiscal arrangements
- XXXII. Provincial review and control of public spending
- XXXIII. Attracting industry to the province
- XXXIV. Conclusion

## PART II: A HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE

CHAPTER TWO: The development of local government in New Brunswick 40

- I. Introduction
- II. Trends of incorporation
- III. First period: municipal government by quarter sessions
- IV. Second period: the creation of municipal corporations
- V. Third period: local self-government
- VI. Nineteenth century municipal administration
  - a) Introduction
  - b) Taxation
  - c) Liquor licensing
  - d) Education,
  - e) Great roads- and bye roads
  - f) Public health
  - g) Public welfare
  - h) Electoral revision
  - i) Summary
- VII. Fourth period: municipal government in the Twentieth Century
  - a) Introduction
  - b) County councils
  - c) Urban representation on county councils
  - d) City councils
  - e) Town councils
  - f) Villages and Local Improvement Districts
  - g) Local school boards
  - h) City and town school boards
  - i) County school finance boards
- VIII. Twentieth Century municipal administration

## PART III: MAJOR RESPONSIBILITIES OF THE MUNICIPALITIES AND PROVINCIAL PARTICIPATION

CHAPTER THREE:

- A. General government, protection to persons and property, administration of justice, public works, civil defence and community planning 70
- I. The distinction between local and general services

- II. General government
- III. Protection of persons and property
- “IV: Administration of justice
- V. Public works
- VI. Civil defence
- VII. Community planning

CHAPTER FOUR: B. Education 75  
 \ Statistical appendix

CHAPTER FIVE: C. Public health, hospitals and social welfare 94

- I. Public health
- II. Mental hospital and clinic services
- III. Hospital services
- IV. Social welfare
- V. Municipal homes
- VI. Child welfare

CHAPTER SIX:

- D. Unconditional grants to municipalities, with a comment and resume of recent developments in provincial-municipal relations to3
- I. Subsidy payments to municipalities (unconditional grants)
- II. Snow removal grant
- III. Comment on recent developments in provincial-municipal relations
- IV. Resume of present provincial financial participation in municipal functions and of provincial payments to municipalities
  - a) Protection to persons and property
  - \ b) Administration of justice
  - c) Public works
  - \ d) Education
  - e) Health and hospitals
  - f) Social welfare
  - g) Civil defence
  - h) Subsidies

PART IV: *GENERAL AND LOCAL SERVICES:  
 A PROGRAMME FOR RECONSTRUCTION*

CHAPTER SEVEN: General argument for the recommended re-allocation of functions between provincial and municipal governments 112

- I. Purpose of chapter
- II. No perfect solution to present problems
- III. Origins of the present structure
- IV. Inappropriateness of this structure today
- V. Intervention by the province and the decline of local autonomy
- VI. Weaknesses of property taxation
- VII. Basic requirements for a satisfactory solution

- VIII. A choice of alternatives
- IX. Getting to the roots of the problem
- X. /- Reform of property assessment, taxation and collection
- \ XI. Proposals for the Commission form of administration
- XII. Further advantages of recommended programme: the achievement of fiscal equity

\ CHAPTER EIGHT: Public elementary and secondary education 125

- I. Introduction
- II. Basic weakness of financial structure
- III. Educational standards
- I v. School districts and consolidation
- V. Administration and local autonomy
- VI. The main elements of our recommendations concerning education
- VII. Foundation and standard programmes
- VIII. Salaries
- IX. The quality of instruction
- X. Some further sources of dissatisfaction with the present system
- XI. Supplements to the standard programme
- \ XII. Cost and financing of the new programme
- XIII. Establishment of a public schools commission
- XIV. Recommendations
- x v. Conclusion

CHAPTER NINE: Social Welfare 142

- I. Introduction
- II. Fundamental weaknesses of the present programme
- III. The necessity for provincial assumption of the responsibility for social welfare
- I v. The need for revision in federal cost-sharing arrangements
- V. Brief resume
- VI. A rational objective for the social assistance programme
- VII. Conditions required to meet objective
- VIII. The vital importance of acquiring skilled social workers
- IX. Provision of mental and medical care for the indigent
- X. The urgent necessity for placing the recommended provincial responsibility for social welfare under a welfare commission
- \ XI. Cost of the proposed new programme
- XII. Recommendations
- XIII. The effect of these recommendations

- CHAPTER TEN: Public health and hospital services 149
- I. The need for better planning and controls in the hospital care programme
  - II. Various possible approaches toward achieving more effective controls
  - III. Recommendations for the hospital care programme
  - IV. Mental hospital and clinic services
  - V. Public health services
  - VI. Recommendations for public health services
- CHAPTER ELEVEN: The Administration of justice 159
- I. The basis for provincial government concern
  - II. Present arrangements and the need for changes
    - a) Court rooms
    - b) Gaols
    - c) Lock-ups
    - d) Court reporters
    - e) Sheriffs
    - f) Coroners
    - g) Registry offices
    - h) Clerks of the peace (crown prosecutors)
    - i) County magistrates and juvenile court judges
    - j) Cost of criminal prosecutions
    - k) Cost of supreme and county court proceedings
    - l) Probate courts
    - m) Court of divorce and matrimonial causes
  - III. Summary of costs
  - IV. Recommendation
- CHAPTER TWELVE: The New Municipal Structure 170
- I. Introduction
  - II. The new municipal structure
  - III. Cities and towns
  - IV. The new villages
  - V. The new local service districts
  - VI. Community planning
  - VII. Department of Public Works expenditures for local improvements
  - VIII. Urban highway connecting links
  - IX. Title to streets in municipalities
  - X. The special position of Oromocto
  - XI. Elimination of private municipal acts
  - XII. Civil defence
  - XIII. The statutory basis for responsible municipal government
  - XIV. Municipal autonomy
  - xv. The use of utility commissions
  - XVI. Municipal administration
- XVII. Municipal elections and government
  - XVIII. Qualifications for candidates for municipal office
  - XIX. Constitution of the Municipal Affairs Commission
  - xx. The joint provision of services by adjoining municipalities
  - XXI. Amalgamations and annexations
    - a) Counties
    - b) Cities
    - c) Towns
  - XXII. Summary of recommendations made in chapter
- Appendix: Text of *Amalgamation Bulletin* distributed by Greater Bathurst Amalgamation Committee
- PART V: *THE NEW FINANCIAL STRUCTURE*
- CHAPTER THIRTEEN: Property tax assessments 206
- I. Introduction
  - II. Real property
    - a) Tax base
    - b) Basis of assessment
    - c) Exemptions and reliefs
    - d) Assessment procedures
    - e) Appointment of assessors
    - f) Assessment practices
    - g) Provincial controls over assessment procedures
    - h) Equalization
    - i) Conclusions
    - j) Recommendations
  - III. Transitional arrangements
  - IV. Personal property
    - a) Assessment procedures
    - b) Recommendations
  - V. Appeals against property taxation assessments
  - VI. Collection of property taxes
  - VII. Assessment and taxation of woodlots and timberlands
    - a) The need for special treatment
    - b) Farm woodlots and other small timber properties
    - c) The crown timberlands
  - VIII. Summary of recommendations made in chapter
- Appendices to Chapter 13:
- I. Suggested form of tax base
  - II. Recommended definitions of assessed values
  - III. Estimated 1962 real property tax base calculated according to Commission recommendations
- CHAPTER FOURTEEN: Municipal revenues and debt management 263
- I. Introduction
  - II. Municipal financial responsibility

- III. The poll taxes
- IV. The new taxing powers
- V. Non-tax revenues and provincial grants
- VI. Federal grants and ex gratia payments
- VII. Licences, fees and right-to-work taxes
- VIII. Utility deficits
- IX. Summary of non-tax revenues
- X. The need for equalizing grants
- XI. Proposals for unconditional grants
- XII. Requirements to be met by the new grant formula
- XIII. Simplified illustration and explanation of the new formula
- XIV. Outline of the calculations on a 1961 basis
- xv. Detailed calculation of recommended unconditional grants (1961 basis)
- XVI. Concluding comments on unconditional grants
- XVII. Debt management and the disposition of existing debt
- XVIII. Summary of recommendations made in chapter

CHAPTER FIFTEEN: Provincial revenue requirements and the new tax structure 295

- I. Scope of chapter
- II. Provincial revenue requirements
- III. The new tax structure
- IV. The real property tax
- V. Application of the tax to business properties
- VI. The tax agreements
- VII. The assessment of personal property
- VIII. The new tax on automotive vehicles
- IX. The retail sales tax and taxes on miscellaneous services
- X. The individual income tax
- XI. The corporation income tax
- XII. Summary of recommendations made in chapter

CHAPTER SIXTEEN: Public apathy and the control of provincial government spending 3 15

- I. The problem of priorities
- II. Collective cabinet responsibility
- III. Treasury board
- IV. Auditor general
- V. The use of administrative commissions
- VI. Need to strengthen the public service
- VII. Protection and enhancement of democratic prerogatives

- VIII. Central purchasing office
- IX. Decentralization of administration into regions
- X. Need for co-ordinator for implementation of recommended programmes
- XI. Recommendations

CHAPTER SEVENTEEN: Attracting industry to the province 323

- I. The need for more industry
- II. Taxation and industrial location
- III. Industrialization and the level of services
- IV. Attracting industry
- V. Keeping costs down
- VI. Crown forests and mineral rights
- VII. Directorships
- VIII. Recommendations

PART VI: APPENDICES

- A. Orders in Council 62-294 of April 16, 1962, and 62-888 of November 21, 1962, establishing the Commission's rules of procedure
- B. Text of Interim Report dated August 12, 1963
- C. List of parties making representations at public hearings and by correspondence
- D. List of briefs and replies to questionnaires filed by New Brunswick municipalities
- E. Changes in the burden of taxation in New Brunswick, 1926-61
- F. Combined state or provincial and local government taxation, Canada and the United States, 1959-60
- G. Survey of the impact of local taxes on agricultural properties, New Brunswick, 1962
- H. Report on study trip to Sweden by Professor A. J. Boudreau, 1963
- I. Places with population of 300 or more persons not incorporated as cities, towns or villages., New Brunswick, 196 1
- J. Analysis of land ownership in New Brunswick
- K. Cutting activity in New Brunswick forests, 1959-60 to 1961-62
- L. Rated bed capacity of public hospitals, New Brunswick, June 30, 1963
- M. List of acts relating to incorporation and taxing powers of New Brunswick municipalities compiled by Mr. J. K. McKee, Solicitor for the Department of Municipal Affairs
- N. Summary of tax concessions granted by New Brunswick municipalities : a report prepared by Mr. J. K. McKee, Solicitor for the Department of Municipal Affairs
- O. Comparative Statistical tables
  - 1. Municipal revenues by source and type of municipality, New Brunswick, 1961

- 2A. Revenues of New Brunswick municipalities, 1961: amounts
- 2B. Revenues of New Brunswick municipalities, 1961: by source as a percentage of total revenue
- 2c. Revenues of New Brunswick municipalities, 1961: dollars per capita
- 3. Revenues of New Brunswick municipalities, by source, 1957-61
- 4. Increase in per capita tax levies by New Brunswick municipalities, between 1951-52 and 1960-61
- 5. Combined current municipal and school board revenues and expenditures, New Brunswick, 1957-61
- 6. Municipal expenditures by function and type of municipality, New Brunswick, 1961
- 7A. Expenditures of New Brunswick municipalities, 1961: amounts
- 7B. Expenditures of New Brunswick municipalities, 1961: by function as a percentage of total expenditure
- 7c. Expenditure of New Brunswick municipalities, 1961: dollars per capita
- 8. Per capita expenditures of urban municipalities on services of a local nature, New Brunswick, 1951-61
- 9. Net general provincial government expenditure by function, New Brunswick, fiscal years ended March 31, 1953-61
- 10. Combined provincial and municipal government expenditures, by function and province, 1960
- 11. Expenditures by function as a per cent of total provincial and municipal government expenditures, ten provinces, 1960
- 12. Provincial and municipal government shares as a percentage of their combined expenditures, by function and province, 1960
- 13. Personal income per capita by province, 1957-61
- 14. Net general expenditure by provincial governments, per capita and as a percentage of provincial personal income, 1956-60
- 15. Net general expenditure by municipal governments, per capita and as a percentage of provincial personal income, 1956-60
- 16. Net general expenditure, provincial and municipal governments combined, per capita and as a percentage of provincial personal income, 1956-60
- 17. Provincial government revenue from taxation per capita and as a percentage of provincial personal income, 1956-60
- 18. Municipal government revenue from taxation, per capita and as a percentage of provincial personal income, 1956-60
- 19. Revenue from taxation, provincial and municipal governments combined, per capita and as a percentage of provincial personal income, 1956-60
- 20. Direct and indirect debt of provincial governments, per capita and as a percentage of provincial personal income, 1956-60
- 21. Direct and indirect debt of municipal governments, per capita and as a percentage of provincial personal income, 1956-60
- 22. Direct and indirect debt of provincial and municipal governments combined, per capita and as a percentage of provincial personal income, 1956-60
- 23. Municipal tax collections, expressed as a percentage of current tax levy and provincial personal income, 1956-60
- 24. Municipal property tax revenue as a percentage of provincial personal income, 1956-60
- 25. Estimated yield of one per cent retail sales tax on existing base, as a percentage of provincial personal income, selected provinces, 1957-60
- 26. Provincial government revenue from tax rental agreements, by province, 1960
- 27. Estimated yield of standard income taxes, by province, 1962
- 28. Individual income tax payers and labour force as a percentage of total population, by province, 1961
- 29. Number of private acts dealing with municipal matters passed by the legislatures of seven common law provinces, 1953-62